

PERSONNEL COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

Monday, September 21st, 2015 @ 6:00pm

Mayor's Office

Present: Alders: Sid Boersma (Chair), Pat O'Connor, Paul Lawrence, Thomas Majewski, Mayor Donna Olson (ex-officio)

Others in attendance: Chief Leck, Laurie Sullivan, Brian Hoops, Scott Wagner, Cindy McGlynn, Richard McDonald, Ann Antonsen

1. CALL TO ORDER: Sid Boersma called the meeting to order at 6:01pm

- 2.** Approval of the Minutes of the August 3, 2015 Personnel Committee Meeting. Motion by Boersma, second by Lawrence. Motion carried unanimously.

3. Communications:

A. Director Gillingham asked to table the Broker Update to allow more time for Comp Study Results. All were in agreement.

B. Director Gillingham updated the committee regarding upcoming Personnel Committee meeting dates. Scheduled dates are as follows: Monday, September 28th, 2015 and Monday, October 5th, 2015. O'Connor stated he will be unable to attend the meeting on Monday, September 28th.

C. Boersma asked Chief Leck for an update on PFC (Police & Fire Commission) - SGT (Sergeant) and new hire status. Chief Leck is scheduled to meet with the PFC (Police & Fire Commission) on Wednesday, September 23, 2015 at 5:30pm to review the twenty-six (26) top candidates. The top 12-15 applicants will be interviewed on October 19th & 20th. We had a total of 9 applications for Sergeant. The six (6) SGT (Sergeant) interviews will be held Wednesday, October 14th beginning at 5:30pm. Boersma asked if Leck was happy with the amount and quality of applications we received. Leck replied he was very happy.

4. Old Business

- a.** Domestic Partner tabled until 10/05/15 meeting.

5. New Business

- a.** Boersma introduced Ann Antonsen, representative of Springsted. Antonsen proceeded to go through a printed form of a PowerPoint presentation to show the outcome of the Comp Study done for the City of Stoughton. Antonsen reported the City of Stoughton has not had a Comp Study done for at least 15 years.
The objectives being to evaluate and review the City's current classification and compensation program, review wage and benefit levels, develop a compensation program that will address the current market, review and develop guidelines for implementation. In order to do this Springsted met with administration and department heads to gather information such as current compensation and benefits, evaluate positions based on job responsibilities and requirements. They obtained market salary and benefits information.

Employees of every position filled out PAQ (Position Analysis Questionnaire). All of this information was used to evaluate where positions should fit as related to other positions and what the requirements and duties were for each position. Springsted then developed a salary line and determined pay grades. They then developed implementation options. Boersma asked so; you matched job responsibilities to each position? Ann stated that they were all very similar. O'Conner asked if the bold print of "Evaluate positions based on job responsibilities and requirements" was on purpose, and what for? Gillingham replied that was an important step because that is how they determined what is required of the position. Lawrence asked who the cities were that were involved. Ann replied Stoughton, Middleton, Monona, Sun Prairie, Verona, and McFarland.

Ann went on to say that a Salary Survey was done with the benchmark Communities. Lawrence asked what are the Benchmark communities? Ann replied there were 47 public sector organizations, select private organizations, the Department of Labor and Bureau of Labor Statistics. Of the 49 benchmark positions 31 matched the City of Stoughton. Sid asked if all of the other cities involved were doing a comprehensive study as well. Ann reported that not all of them had, but that it is more prevalent now because of Act 10. The study's findings were that city positions do not have established salary ranges. The current City salaries are 11.49% above market average minimum salaries, .84% below market average Midpoint salaries, and 12.43% below market average maximum salaries. Actual salaries were compared to market ranges regardless of the employees years of service. There are also concerns regarding recruitment and retention of employees. Boersma asked if we are paying more or less than what other cities are paying. Ann explained that it shows our current salaries are higher than the market but lower when compared to other cities. O'Conner asked for an explanation of Minimum and Mid market. Ann replied Minimum is entry level salary, Mid is market. Director Gillingham explained further that entry level employees with better skills should have a higher minimum salary. Ann stated that there should be internal adjustments for employees with higher qualifications. Director Gillingham stated that the market place is very competitive and it is increasingly more difficult to recruit and retain qualified staff. Ann replied that it is very competitive, with the need to spend more time and energy recruiting in order to find qualified applicants.

Ann explained the SAFE system "Systematic Analysis and Factor Evaluation" System. The factors are:

- Training & Ability
- Experience Required
- Level of Work
- Human Relations Skills
- Physical Demands
- Working Conditions
- Independence of Actions
- Impact on End Results
- Supervision Exercised

Director Gillingham explained "What is required of the position. Not the individuals or years of service but what the position requirements are."

Ann explained the Pay Philosophy which is:

- Provide fair and equitable compensation to employees
- Balance external market with City positions
- Maintain competitive pay structure with consideration of City's fiscal resources
- Performance based component for increases for individual employees
- Develop an understandable compensation program

Lawrence asked where you find comparisons for positions like Parks Director. Ann stated that not all positions have a match on the market. Boersma stated that we can use a city to city comparable in that situation.

Ann & Director Gillingham explained that the City will not be moving with the pay for performance plan until 2017. For 2016 we will be adjusting salaries to minimum market amounts. O'Conner asked what the difference was and Director Gillingham explained that when the salaries are all at midpoint and headed to market max the raise will slow. Ann stated raises will be based on performance and adjusted annually on Anniversary dates.

Boersma asked if anyone was way overpaid. Ann stated that the Director of the Youth Center, Greg Hoyte, is out of range but that does not affect the city because it is paid through a grant. O'Conner asked if there were positions not included. Director Gillingham stated none of the Utilities positions were included. Majewski stated that he does not agree with the fact that they are part of the City and at the same time not part of the city. We continue to appease them and the culture continues. Either they are part of the City or they are not. Mayor Olson stated it is because they are rate payer supported not tax payer supported. Open discussion about when the study began. Director Sullivan stated the cities had to agree on an IFP agreement between the cities. It was a 6 community decision to use these benchmarks.

O'Conner stated the Police positions were involved in the study, why was the Library done separately? Mayor Olson stated that it is a state law. The Library is given a certain amount of funds by the City and the Library Board allocates the funds.

Ann explained the proposed plan showing the steps of pay based on performance from lowest to highest position grade.

Implementation of this plan will involve moving the employees that are paid at a rate that falls below market to minimum. Annual cost to bring employees to minimum is \$47,054.01 Leadership would be moved to Mid point at an annual cost of \$43,100.23. This increases market comparability.

City Staff Recommendation:

- COLA increase at 1/1/2016
1% across the board: \$50,000
- Comp Study increases at Anniversary Date
Bring all Staff to minimum: \$28,635
Bring all to Min and Leadership to Mid: \$47,253
Leadership to Mid at Anniversary: \$26,206

Board discussion about how this would be implemented. Director Gillingham stressed that salaries would not go up for those people who do not perform. Any increase will be performance based only. Boersma asked if we were afraid there might be a backlash against this performance based program. Director Gillingham replied that this is why we used an outside source. Mayor Donna stated we will need training in an evaluation process. Director Gillingham said we will determine an evaluation process and have forms. Department heads will need to grade employees throughout the year. These raises will be given on Anniversary dates so it is spread more evenly throughout the year. Boersma asked if there were any questions. Laurie stated this was a very thorough study and we need to move forward on this. We need to align job positions with market rates. Boersma moved to approve. Several members of the committee explained they were not ready to approve yet that there is a lot to digest.

Director Gillingham stated that PAQ (Position Analysis Questionnaire) will start with the two new Utilities positions. McGlynn asked if they will see the comp plan at the employee meetings, to which Director Gillingham replied the Heads will meet with the employees.

Boersma asked about benefits. Ann explained they were fairly consistent with other cities. Our sick leave was standard, accumulated sick leave was high, health insurance cost was higher, but our deductible lower.
Director Gillingham read our future agenda items.

Chair Boersma asked that we move the meeting time to a 6:00 start so Alderperson Majewski is able to attend the meetings. All were in agreement.

ADJOURNMENT

Motion to adjourn by Lawrence, second by O'Connor. Motion carried unanimously. Meeting adjourned at 7:34pm.